

What Can We Know About Our Graduates As They Enter the Workforce?

January 19, 2017

Michael Lesiecki -Welcome everyone we're at the beginning of our webinar today titled *What Can We Know About Our Graduates as They Enter the Workforce*.

Webinar Details

Michael Lesiecki - Let me tell you some details of the webinar, on this webinar you'll be in listen-only mode using your computer or phone or whatever audio device you have but please ask your questions via the chat window you will be you will receive a link to the recording and to the slides as well and this webinar is brought you by the Centers Collaborative for Technical Assistance with additional support from the National Science Foundation through the ATE Collaborative Impact Project. Thanks for joining today.

The CCTA is led by

Michael Lesiecki - What is the CCTA thing well its led by five centers you can see them there the National Center for Convergence Technology in Texas; the South Carolina ATE Center; the Florida ATE Center; Bio-Link out at the City College of San Francisco and the most famous one Networks Resource Center at the Maricopa Community College's in Phoenix, Arizona.

CCTA Purpose

Michael Lesiecki - What's the purpose of this grant besides bringing you these webinars? Well originally responded to requests from the Department of Labor and the NSF to have this group of centers provide technical assistance to grantees not only labor grantees but everyone that's working on grant-funded things in the workforce area. We have deliverables topical webinars like the one today, a series of best practices which now appear as two page white papers on the website and convenings which were going to host continue to host this summer more about that as we get to the end of the thing.

Poll #1: Your Affiliation

Michael Lesiecki - Let's start with the poll today I'd like to know your affiliation in just a moment I'm going to launch the poll here, there you go on your screen now it asks you to respond, I'm involved with an NSF grant, I'm involved with a TAACCCT grant, both of them or neither. Do you say neither or neither I don't know everybody's clicking you know the answer this one pretty well so give you just another moment I'll count down from five and then we'll take a look at the results of our poll 5, 4, 3, 2, 1 polls closed. Sharing the results with you and there it is you can see that we have a spread in our audience around close to forty percent above are involved with TAACCCT, a good twenty percent with NSF and a number of people were just simply interested in this topic. Thanks very much for responding to that poll, I'm going to close this one now.

Poll: How many people are listening with you?

Michael Lesiecki - I have a second poll and this helps us demonstrate our impact how many people are listening in the room with you, so we actually count these numbers just a moment I'm going to launch the poll we go there's on your screen is it just yourself or their couple of people with you. Sometimes here at our own offices we get together at lunch time around a conference room and project the webinar up on the screen we like to do things like that. So thanks very much for responding I'll give you

just another moment and then we'll take a look at those results and then we'll get started today 5, 4, 3, 2, 1 closing the poll. Sharing the results with you and you see of most of us are by ourselves but a number that have one or two in some cases more sharing this event with each other. Thank you, I've closed that poll, on to the webinar. That helps us demonstrate impact our presenters.

Today's Presenters

Michael Lesiecki - I'm Michael Lesiecki, the guy on the left there I'm the Director of the Maricopa Advanced Technology Education Center in the Maricopa Community College District, I work on our workforce development unit and I'm a personal investigator on an NSF grant and heavily involved in several of the TAACCCT grants. So it's my pleasure let me introduce my colleague John Carrese, John you're the Director of San Francisco's Bay Center of Excellence for labor market research. John is that at City College of San Francisco do I remember that quickly?

John Carrese - Yeah that's correct I'm hosted at City College of San Francisco but serves the 28 colleges in the bay region of San Francisco with labor market research.

Michael Lesiecki – John, how long have you been in that position?

John Carrese - I think I'm in my 18th year Mike, getting close to 20.

Michael Lesiecki - That's great, thanks today I'm saying that somewhat tongue-in-cheek but we're going to have a competition between Arizona and California to see who knows the most about our graduates and I'm going to give away the answer it's California but we're going to find that out in a few minutes, thanks for joining today.

Agenda

Michael Lesiecki - John this is what we'd like to talk about right, here's our agenda folks. Why do we want to know this information I know many of you know the answer to that. But this is important what can we know number two and how can we know it. John I want us to dive in and look in-depth at first pilot attempts at the Maricopa system here in Arizona and then we're going to turn to you to talk about your CTE OS the outcome survey now and it's I think it's 50 or right at the California County Colleges. You've got some real data there to back up the sort of things that you're saying.

Why?

Michael Lesiecki - Let's roll right on here, now why are we doing this? I know all of you understand this but I think about this question too why? Are our CTE students employable, we'd like to know that do they find jobs in the field in which we train them for well that's pretty important right especially when we talk about these regulations that allow us to show that to our students and then the ideal world do they see an increase in income? What do you think of those questions John, do you agree with that?

John Carrese - I do and you know the way we look at in California Mike really one way to think of it is we want to know was the program worth it and are we justified in offering it because we're using taxpayer dollars and those we want to invest those dollars wisely and be good stewards of the resources and funds for career technical education. So I basically that's why we're doing it, I think.

Michael Lesiecki - Makes sense thanks, I think all of us on the line are gonna agree with the why's here.

What?

Michael Lesiecki - But let's move forward and ask okay what do we want to know, what do we actually want to know about this. Now here's some ideas and for those of you as you think about constructing your own surveys or looking at your own surveys, what is it about the program that students value and why do they value that's a critical piece of evidence that we can use.

What is our market for this program?

Michael Lesiecki - Here's another question what's our market for this program all of us are concerned about attracting students to our program every community college in the country wants to attract students to their program so by doing this by knowing what happens to our graduates we can answer this question what students are we trying to recruit into the program and why, where do they see the value so we can market to that value.

How much do students earn after graduation and what factors can this be attributed to?

Michael Lesiecki - Here's another one how much do the students earn after graduation and what factors can this be attributed to hopefully they're going to tribute some of that wage gain to their skills and knowledge that they obtained from our system.

How does our program compare, to similar programs in other colleges, in terms of employment and earning results?

Michael Lesiecki - Here's another one how does our program compare to similar programs in other colleges terms of employment and earning results right we want to measure the efficacy the worse of our programs and we do this in comparison to others you know this old saying what you can measure you can improve and so this is one way of looking at it.

What Can We Know?

Michael Lesiecki - Ok what can we know now this first one I'm saying a little bit tongue-in-cheek John I'm saying what can you know, what the graduates tell us is what we can know that's one level of information. The second one is interesting what the government will tell us about them and we're going to turn to that in just a moment. And today the whole world it seems sometimes the social media but what social media or other tools that exist might say about graduates today excuse me this is a very rapidly changing area things are changing just in the last few months about what social media and data mining and tell us about our graduates.

How Can We Know It?

Michael Lesiecki - Alright so that's what, how can we know it well everyone on the line say look you can send out a survey by email to your graduates right that's sort of I mean a knee-jerk response but it's a it's an obvious response random survey. Many of you know that the survey rates on efforts like that aren't particularly high so how can you what can you do about that how can you increase that. Number two you can do a phone survey that's going to give you a different perspective on your students sometimes I think that those who respond to emails are only the ones that have done well of course they want to tell you that they've done well and they'll click on that survey length but you have an opportunity to talk to someone by phone you can really gain some information. Number three bullet use Department of Economic Security that we call it here in Arizona data and many of us know it is UI unemployment insurance wage data. Fourth one is probably the newest kid on the block certainly within just within the last year mine social media I'll tell you a little bit about a service provider like EMSI there will be an Amazon gift card for the first person to tell me what EMSI means in the question window, I'm just joking about that actually forget their full acronym but many of us know them as a provider of

workforce related data well they now have a service that aggregates information from the web, from social media and matches our student names to information about them available through social media more about that in just a second.

John Carrese – Mike, I want to get the gift card its Economic Modeling Specialists International.

Michael Lesiecki - I knew you were going to know that one John but I'm sorry you're not eligible for the gift card since you're the presenter today, so thank you. Folks don't hesitate to use the question window as questions or your thoughts come up to you about this it's in the lower right of your pane, ok so thanks John EMSI.

Examples from the Maricopa Community Colleges

Michael Lesiecki - Let's turn now to my world here in Phoenix the Maricopa Community College's one of the largest community college districts in the country, we have 10 colleges and two skill centers we serve close 200,000 students every year. Now I was involved with a project funded by the Walmart foundation that focused on moving low-income adults into middle-skill jobs many of you know this term middle-skill jobs as we looked at the KPI's right the key performance indicators for this grant that were set up right from the beginning the indicator was what was the employment after the intervention after the students went to our program within that six months of their completing what was their employment like. Here's the story and John you might shake your head in a way as is I tell this story so one of our partner colleges I was meeting them we're doing good we're getting students into the program we're having some graduates we had set up Excel spreadsheets to capture information and so I went to my colleagues and I said, "okay now let's get the information that we need about our students as they enter the workforce as they leave us and they enter the workforce," and the person looked at me and said how would we know that, there was a silence in the room on my part after that because I realize how naive I had been. I had just assume that our colleges had stuff in place, we were tracking this thing, individual faculty I talked to had a lot of information about their students they connected with them and they knew what companies they were working at but it turns out that's much more the exception than the rule, I think many of you will agree with that. So how would we know that was the question, so sure the approach that we took we created our own call center and I'll call this create your own call center approach here's the approach we took and I'll show you the results from it we had a database of the students and their contact information we knew which programs they were and we have emails, we had telephone numbers if they would give them to us, so actually had the information about the students as many of you know sometimes their emails change but we have a variety of ways of trying to get them. We decided we would use the call center approach, so we hired a student worker here just a great really focused person we scripted the call and we tried to limited to five questions because we knew we wanted to keep that limit down now we're on the phone we started the calling process it turns out the students actually wanted to be asked they appreciated someone from the Maricopa Community College's asking about how it was going, how they did after the program's, how is their job search going and the students would often talk to us and our person running the call center with a very careful note taker and there was all kinds of information that came back from the students that reflected upon the quality the program, reflected on their jobs and we asked them to give us an employment range where you think you were making somewhere between 25,000 30,000 dollars a year here's a little sidebar turns out many students don't necessarily think in annual wages they think more in hourly wages. So we were careful to frame our questions, let's take a look at some of the results I think you might find them interesting.

Measures

Michael Lesiecki – By what did we measure this impact, well here's the answer fifty-seven percent being silent for a minute, people are thinking I wonder what 57% means, what would you guess fifty-seven percent refers to John I'm not going to ask you that because I think you might already know the answer, ok people are thinking, thinking, thinking. Let me show you some of the data of the 378 students we attempted to contact a hundred and thirty-seven reported employment, 36-percent not bad right you're within six months of the conclusion of the program that's not so bad. Of those 378 an additional 81 that we contacted no not employment yet still working on the job search not employed yet so right away you see now that 57% is the survey response rate and I don't know John maybe you can tell us about your survey response rate but I was excited because of fifty-seven percent survey response rate was something I could take home, I could take it to the bank, I could convince people this was worthwhile. The final data point is we were not capable of reaching forty-two percent of the people either in some cases I forget exactly might have been ten percent of those didn't have a valid contact or didn't answer the phone and we tried different calling times we typically tried three or four calls before wrapping up for the day. Now here you can imagine what I'm thinking here on my grant our grant we had to make an absolute number of students not a percentage and I'm thinking boy if I could get some of those 42-percent we could find out more information, but overall not bad. So look this this call center approach works in terms of response rates. How much it costs? This was an eye-opener for me so remember student workers don't cost that much but nonetheless this was a three month long project and are our person was really acting as project manager here said that we were, she really spent the time it took to outline the project here and do a lot of the ground work not just the calling the structure, the database structure, the data capture and all that was done so if we had to do this again all of that front end time wouldn't have to be paid for again but the fact is over three months we paid her including benefits seven thousand dollars. And if you look at those numbers up there she was able to talk to 218 people bottom line 32 bucks per data point I can just see us going to you to our supervisors and saying give me \$32 and I'll give you know per student I'll give you a contact and they said that seems like a lot of money it made but let me show you some comparison and now before we move on let me respond to one point a question, it's an important one did we try to answer did you try to contact students by text Well today you need overt permission to contact them by text and we didn't at the beginning set that up so we didn't use text messaging. Think if I was to do it differently today as I was enrolling these students I would put in the text message aspect, thank you for that question.

Time and Money

Michael Lesiecki - I think you might find this fascinating if you're going to do this yourself this would be useful, so our program manager said a successful call averaged eight minutes, an unsuccessful call that is placing a call, leaving a message averaged 1.5 minutes therefore in one hour she could make four successful calls and twenty unsuccessful calls. Think about that, that means if I asked her to contact 250 people to actually talk to them, she is going to say Mike that will take me 67 hours, it just gives you a sense now you know a student worker if you had to pay them at an hourly wage wouldn't be bad 67 hours but remember there was all that front end time and set up time, analysis time, data manipulation time that was bundled into this. I tried to give you a realistic data point right you got it so were capable of doing this ourselves, it's not difficult but you do have to pay attention.

Engage A Call Center

Michael Lesiecki - Point number two, Maricopa Community College's pay a call center to do this instead of doing yourself pay somebody else to do it.

Blackboard

Michael Lesiecki - So Blackboard and yes I mean that Blackboard also has a call center function and they will conduct a graduate survey engagement campaign. You have to tell them the information about the survey right you got to give on the survey and then they have a mechanism by which all of this happens and it goes into place. Let me show you some of the data from the Blackboard campaign you can see the date on there right to September of 2016 so it's just happened in the last three months.

Untitled Slide

Michael Lesiecki - From the data turn your eyes to the upper right we attempted to contact 2844 you see that number on the upper right 2844 graduates, they filtered out some bad data and ended up messaging and reaching out to 2589 students and then they actually talked to 550 people on the phone survey participants. So there was a mixture of data on this particular one but they ended up making actually talking to 550 students. And look on towards the left now nineteen percent of those dialed resulted in a completed survey now that means either talk to them or gave them the link to go online and finish it but anyhow so there's there there's response rate nineteen percent, what was the first one 57 remember that so but nonetheless 19 is not bad it was better than that first email survey. Let's look at some of the data from this one.

Contracting With A Call Center: Time and Money

Michael Lesiecki - It takes time and money right, their event was five weeks long they're calling program was five weeks long, they reached 550 people for nineteen percent and it cost 25k, \$25,000 that comes out to \$45 per data point. People are thinking they're writing this down now notice it didn't cost the time I didn't cost the time to construct the survey and manage the data so you got to get out your checkbooks if you want to do it this way. I'm just throwing out some data points, you can talk to me, you can you can call me, you can email and we can talk more about this.

Send Them a Email Survey

Michael Lesiecki – The third way Maricopa again send them an email survey so we took 1832 graduates who finished our program and 2012 -2014 and we talked to them within a year or so of their complete set up pretty much the same survey 9% response so not the end of the world but it's not as strong as one can get from calling. I'm going on too much about the stuff but I'm interested, I'm interested in figuring out how we can know what we can know.

Ask the Government

Michael Lesiecki - Let's turn to the next method which is ask the government. I was going to put a picture of our president-elect here you know figure we should ask the government but I was advised that I shouldn't do that, any way ask the government.

Using Unemployment Insurance Wage Data to Improve Program Employment Outcomes

Michael Lesiecki - Here's a I took this screen from a PowerPoint that I found online and please turn your eyes down to the bottom of the screen if you want to find this information going to Google and type in Mindy Feldbaum and Tim Harmon and this pops up its titled Using Unemployment Insurance Wage Data to Improve Program Employment Outcomes, great title technical assistance guide for Community and Technical College's in our time today we could probably John we could do a whole other webinar on this UI wage data but let me turn to John I'm going to click to the next slide.

For Reference

Michael Lesiecki – Why don't you give us some reference information about your experience with wage, we're not going to focus on it today but I do think it's useful you giving us this data.

John Carrese - Yeah Mike, as we talked about this I wanted to just share what we're doing in California we are able to get data from UI wage data, match it to our community college students because we have a data sharing agreement between our Employment Development Department and our California Community College Chancellor's office so that data sharing agreement allows us to create that match with UI wage data for our graduates and then we created a tool called Salary Surfer you can see it in the slide there, if you click on that link you can actually look at by general areas of study and our college system how students are doing and we give you three data points 2 years before they started training at the college, two years after and then five years after. Now this is aggregated across all of our colleges and we have a hundred thirteen community colleges within the state of California but it's our attempt to use the UI wage data in a meaningful way to try and learn from what's happening to our students when they leave us.

Michael Lesiecki -Good that's good point John you know in our question window there have been several questions about this UI wage data.

Question Break

Michael Lesiecki - Let's go ahead and I think we're at a stopping point where we can take some of those questions right now folks please go ahead and put your questions in. John here's the first one that came in and I'll turn to you about it, what is UI wage data and is there a time lag? How do you get it, how does it work? Why don't you give us a little background?

John Carrese - Well its unemployment insurance data at least in California I think this is pretty typical across the states, we all pay unemployment insurance out of our paychecks, as workers and that goes into a fund so if we are ever unemployed that's what you that's the fund is drawn on to get unemployment benefits, unemployment insurance benefits. So is there a lags some of it now, technical questions about it I gotta say I don't know all of that, there are certain gaps though in the data that I do know, so if you're a federal employee and you're not in California you know for example we're not going to collect, we don't have data on people out of state. I believe federal employees also unemployed, self-employed, self-employed folks so those are some of the gaps in the data. It doesn't tell you everybody that's out there working but it does give you a big chunk of the working population. So that's my like best answer to that.

Michael Lesiecki - That's good thank you. I know in Arizona and I think there's other states it's not perfect I believe you've had UI wage data access for a number of years right.

John Carrese - Right yeah, yeah not sure how long that letter on that data sharing agreements been in place but we have had it for a while.

Michael Lesiecki -And here in Arizona and I know other states like Massachusetts as well have struggled to establish data sharing agreements, ours is close to being finalized but to tell you the truth it's not there yet. John so it's an interesting topic, let's turn now to one other question we were asked a number of things about this EMSI thing you know how does that work, well I'm not an EMSI representative and I don't get any compensation for saying that I'm joking about that but as I understand it you send them a list of your students let's call it 6,000 students and they send out their search algorithms they look at

Twitter, Facebook, LinkedIn, Snapchat, etc. and they try to match names and occupations you know of where people are working and things like that. So they give you raw data and then they give you an option for some data analysis as well. As I understand they're just rolling it out so it's pretty new in that sense.

John Carrese - You know Mike, what you talk about is so new that I use the EMSI's as data tool on a lot and that's something that was new to me so uh yeah so, it's exciting.

Michael Lesiecki - Ok cool so we'll do that the I'm just noticing one of the comments from our window excuse me from our question window in Florida the State Department of Ed provides aggregate data but it does lag quite significantly in time. Here's a question for the California schools getting more updated wage data information do you know the time lag or maybe you're not quite sure?

John Carrese - That I really don't, yeah I'm not sure what the lag is.

Michael Lesiecki – Ok cool and thank you for other ones who have said it and this is the thing you this particular interface you don't get to see everybody else's questions I'm sorry about that, but this one doesn't display everyone's questions so you just gotta throw them in yourself ok. John this is exciting you can tell I'm jazzed about this sort of thing but what I'm really interested is now turning to a poll question because I want to ask a question from our audience.

Audience Poll

Michael Lesiecki - So just a moment here let me pull it up, there goes I'd like to know audience have you tried email surveys, phone surveys, alumni based social media well Johnny better turn on the poll if I'm going to expect them to answer here, so just a moment ok here we go now we've launched ok folks hit that button have you tried email surveys, phone surveys, alumni social media-based, UI wage data, or none of the above. You've probably done some combination to, John a lot of people are putting in while they're doing that one last question we'll just leave that poll up for a moment. Why not use your colleges Alumni Association and ask them do you in California ask your, do you have alumni associations?

John Carrese - Yeah I think some community colleges do Mike and I think that they do use that resource and tap it and I don't have any specific data on the outcomes of those projects, its not anything we're doing statewide but it's certainly something I think local colleges do, it's a great idea.

Michael Lesiecki - You know what we found here is that in general community colleges they don't really necessarily have strong alumni efforts like four years do right, that's more typical for a four-year colleges and those that join the alumni group are relatively small segment of your graduates that's what we found so I'm not sure about that. John let's take a look at the poll let me close the poll 5, 4, 3, 2, 1 hit your buttons, it's closed. Let's take a look at the results John don't know if you can see them on your screen John but email surveys 42-percent that doesn't surprise me, phone only about a fifth of people about nineteen percent, a few people doing social media alumni eight percent, UI wage data more than I thought John, sixteen percent say they use that. I think that's pretty common on TAACCCT grants to try to get that information because it's really one of their key performance metrics. And about fifteen percent respond that they haven't done any of these yet but they're thinking about it interesting stuff.

John Carrese – Yeah great.

Michael Lesiecki - John let me let me hide this poll.

The California Community College CTE Employment Outcomes Survey

Michael Lesiecki - And I'm going to click forward and you're now in control to tell us about the California Community College outcome survey, go ahead John.

John Carrese - Great thanks Mike, I'm going to see if this advances now, Mike could you did you do for me as we go through?

Michael Lesiecki – Hold on just one second, John let me make sure I have that over to you, folks hang on for just one second okay John turn over to here and make sure that that feature is turned over to you. Was that you John?

John Carrese – I think so.

Michael Lesiecki - Yeah okay you got it back, good thank you.

CTE Outcomes Survey: Background

John Carrese - Ok so just to use terminology here not acronyms Career Technical Education CTE so in California I'll go through this rather quickly and at the end I'll show you how you can get more information about what we're doing in California related to finding out about what happens to our students. So here's the background on we piloted this five years ago with 15 community colleges starting in 2012. Mike you might need to do this like it's not responding for me you could advance yeah perfect it was a collaborative effort among community colleges, the Chancellors office, the RP group which is our research and planning group of institutional researchers in the state and then Santa Rosa Junior College, one community college took the lead on managing the project and it really started interestingly with practitioners talking at a dinner after a conference and asking that same question Mike you know how can we find out about what happens to our students when they leave us in the employment market, in the labor market. One college at dinner one person Rock Pfothauer from Cabrillo College is really a leader trying to figure out that question for his college and they had been working for several years doing what they call the Completer/Leaver survey and I'll get into that terminology in a second. And they were willing to share what they had done and see if other folks were interested in joining it to make it more of a regional effort. Why we're interested in doing this we already talked about it I just want to reinforce some of the things from that why slide that we looked at earlier really when you get this data is really giving you great information for your local programs and understanding how to improve them, to provide better outcomes for your students and it's important to document our CTE outcomes locally, regionally but when you can do it a statewide level especially a big state like California with a hundred thirteen community colleges you really have some powerful data that tells you how your whole system is doing in terms of serving your students. I just want to emphasize it was practitioner driven on these once the dinner happen and people said yes we want to try this in the bay region we convened conference calls, we collaborated, we had some folks from the state office joining us, we all work together on vetting be questions of the surveys and methodology and we really we all were excited because it was data we are not going to be able to collect or get in any other way we weren't getting it from UI wage data. So I that was that's why we were excited and we even developed a report format that was going to be helpful in to practitioners and looking at the data so let's go to the next slide Mike, sorry I'm having a little trouble advancing.

CTE Outcomes Survey: Methodology

Michael Lesiecki – We're there John were on the CTE Outcome Survey Methodology, I wonder if there might be an internet blip on your side, but we were looking at that slide.

John Carrese - Okay great so the methodology that we use is we were looking at all three modalities email then US mail then phone calls because we wanted to see if we could increase our response rate we were looking at being able to kind of get all three of these working together we were looking at students about a year-and-a-half after they left this and when we say completing we meant students who got a certificate or a degree and when we say leaving the college we were talking about students that had left after getting and you know getting some course work done but not getting a certificate or degree. So that was really what we were doing on the sample of students in 2016 we were looking at again those two groups students that have gotten an award, a vocational award of six or more units and then this other group that we started calling Skill Builders they were the students that took several courses nine or more CT units but they did not really re-enroll at the college the following year by taking more than five units, so we created this category which really didn't exist before and they were the students that on had formerly been called leavers and they really weren't on the radar we didn't even count them is it no way to measure them or their outcomes we were only counting award as a successful outcome. So now we're looking at these formerly called leavers as maybe Skill Builders students that were coming to take several courses and they were actually once they went out into the labor market being very successful and that data was showing up in the survey and we were excited about that.

Michael Lesiecki -Hey Johnny, it's Mike do you know here at Maricopa after talking to you we did an analysis of that and found an amazing number of students in that Skill Builder criteria and we're thinking holy cow they've achieved exactly what they wanted and we're starting to track that now thanks to you.

John Carrese - Fantastic ok I think that the data part of this that we were looking at multiple sets of data to survey response data, data we could get from our chancellor's office and then any enhancements to the data from the local college like better student contact information. Ok Mike could you advance to the next slide for me.

CTE Outcomes Survey: Primary Purpose

Michael Lesiecki - We're there John primary purpose.

John Carrese -Ok so let's see, yeah our primary purpose really was we really wanted to understand how our students doing you know where they employable, did they find jobs in their field in which we trained them for and did we see an increase in their income in other words as we said before was their program worth it and where we justified in offering it and as they said also before this is great data for looking at program improvement .Ok I am having some internet connection problems Mike so can you advance.

CTE Outcomes Survey: Overall Statewide Results 2016

Michael Lesiecki -We're on the next slide, which says Overall Statewide Results and now.

Statewide Findings

Michael Lesiecki - I'm going to turn to the one that say Statewide Findings first bullet 28-percent response.

John Carrese - Yeah we've got a response rated that we're pretty happy with twenty-eight percent in order to get this last year we had to send the survey to about 350 thousand students in the we had surveyed that number to get a hundred thousand responses and that was across 70 colleges so a 28 percent response rate and ninety-one percent satisfaction rate with education and training that our

students were getting that's what they told us that they were satisfied and thirty-eight percent of the students transferred to another college or university, ok can we go to the next slide.

Findings: Employment Status

Michael Lesiecki –We're they're on the pie chart.

John Carrese - Okay this is the findings on employment status.

Michael Lesiecki - Right yeah you can go.

John Carrese - I'm not going to read all the numbers in the chart for you but I want to highlight a few things, seventy-seven percent of respondents are employed for pay that's aggregated data across the state the 70 colleges that we surveyed and that is a, that seventy-seven percent is a combination of the big red or maroon part of the pie, fifty-seven percent are employed in one job, eleven percent are employed in more than one job, plus if you look at the orange slice eleven percent are employed at more than one job and then that blue slice in the upper one o'clock section of the pie is folks that are self-employed that's nine percent. If you combine all those and that's that seventy-seven percent who are employed for pay, so it's a pretty high percentage were pretty excited about that next slide.

Findings: Work Status

Michael Lesiecki – We're there Findings the work status. It's the bar chart is all displayed.

John Carrese – Yeah, the findings here again I won't read all of it to you but we break out the employment by full-time status and then two looks at part-time status, 20 to 39 hours per week and then less than 20 hours a week so you can see I'll just talk about full-time right now but the blue bars before training and the after is after they've left the college and full-time students working 40 hours a week or more went from oh looks like about you know thirty-seven percent or so up to about fifty percent roll over fifty percent. So that's exciting to see that growth in students who are going to who are working full-time, compared to before right. So we go to the next slide and you can look at the part-time a result as well.

Findings: Working in the Field of Training

Michael Lesiecki - So on this slide it says Working in the Field of Training a majority of students sixty-nine percent that their job is in their field or close.

John Carrese - Right and so the way we you can look at the bar chart you can see in the same exact pretty much exact field of study 45% were employed when we surveyed them and we asked them were they employed in some area close to their field of study or close to it and twenty-four percent said yes to that. When you combine those two you get the sixty-nine percent and that made us also feel like well our students are going out and getting jobs in the areas which they were studying in and that's actually really positive data, ok next slide please.

Findings: Wage Increase

Michael Lesiecki - Wage increase John.

John Carrese -Yeah I think this is maybe the most exciting and compelling data that people keep coming back to in California because they can use it in so many different ways and it's showing that the hourly wage of respondents increased 41-percent from their wage before their studies to their hourly wage

after studies. So you can see those numbers about seventeen dollars and sixty-two cents on average before and then \$24.87 after and that is the forty-one percent increase and when you're talking about trying to show impact that's a very powerful and compelling statistic.

Michael Lesiecki - We agree with that, I wish I could claim those numbers here, we might have them I just don't feel at this point I have enough data that I can be as strong as you guys are here.

John Carrese - Yeah and again this is statewide data remind people this was last year's data 70 community colleges participated across the state and that's about a hundred thousand students that were serving that's a lot of data.

Michael Lesiecki – Cool.

John Carrese – We can go to the next slide.

CTE Outcomes Survey: Statewide Results for the Past 5 Years

Michael Lesiecki - Yeah now we're going to look at your results from the past five years.

Participation and Response Rates

Michael Lesiecki - On the first slide it's got two Y axes, one that's showing your response rate and the other side shows a number of colleges participating.

John Carrese – Exactly, so if you look at the blue bar that's the number of colleges participating and you can see the pilot year we just got together in the San Francisco bay area region after that dinner and created a pilot project we had 15 colleges participating. And then you can see that the bars growing in those next three years up to 40 in 2015 and then you can see in 2016 we kind of reached I think the tipping point we had people learning about this project and getting excited about participating in it again they're paying to participate in this, they are using their own resources and funds to pay for the surveying of their students and we hit 70 and colleges that it's not on this slide I'll just tell you the colleges that use all three modalities the email, the US mail and then the phone calling have the biggest response rate on average. You can see that the response rate in 2016 was 28 percent; colleges could choose not to, it was less expensive if they just use one modality or two modalities as far as reaching students. They spent less but they also got a lower response rate so that's the trade-off. Now the exciting thing with the blue bar in 2017 is that the Chancellor's office of the state of California Community Colleges Chancellor's office is now investing their own resources to fund all 113 colleges to do this survey in this coming year in 2017. So they've in looking at this effort that started five years ago from practitioners from the ground coming from the field they're now saying wow this is fantastic and they're investing their resources and it will be paid for by the state community college system for all 113 colleges. So we're really excited about that we think that you know sometimes small things grow into very powerful and compelling things that the top of the system decided to invest in it so that was a great outcome, next slide Mike.

Number of Students Surveyed

Michael Lesiecki -Ok John we see now your number of student surveyed your last bar is the 2017 estimates, that's a pretty big number.

John Carrese -Yeah that number is a hundred fifty thousand to take that and go backwards we estimate that we will be able to serve 150,000 students going with historic response rates that we've looked at in

the past they made, this the estimate when all 113 colleges are participating. You can see last year with 70 colleges participating we had a hundred thousand students that were surveyed and yeah you can see how it grew over the five years, the next slide.

Employment Status

Michael Lesiecki - Okay we're on the employment status with your multiple step bars.

John Carrese - Right so there's a lot of data on here in the interest of time because I think we want to probably get some questions and wrap up, the orange bars just telling you the students employed at one job that ranges that hovers right around that sixty percent line with fifty-seven percent in 2016. The brownish bar is employed in more than one job that's hovering right around at you know just below ten percent right around ten percent. And self-employed also that's the green bar that's hovering around ten percent. So those three combined are the folks that are leaving our system that are employed and you can see the line is telling you the percentage of our students that we surveyed that transferred to another college or university and that in 2016 was thirty-eight percent. So a lot of data there but you can you can look at that you'll be able to go back to the slides will kind of take a closer look at that on your own if you would like to if you're interested, next slide Mike.

Employed in Field

Michael Lesiecki - Ok we're there the fraction employed in the field has been pretty consistent since 2012.

John Carrese - Absolutely yeah it's hovering right around you know it's in the high sixty percent, just shy of seventy percent so 2016 at sixty-nine percent but it's been right around there in that 60 to 69 percent range over the five years. Yeah so people are employed in their fields again that's something we're really pleased with.

Change in Wages Over Time

Michael Lesiecki - I jumped to the Change in Wages Over Time looking at two bars your wages before and wages after and percent change is pretty interesting stuff.

John Carrese - Yeah the blue bar is telling you the wages before you can see that in in dollars hourly wage and you can see how it's jumping across all five years its increasing. The orange line is telling you the percentage of change which is really the probably most compelling data and that started in 2012 around thirty two percent hovering right around there 32-34 percent between 2012 and 2015 and then in 2016 it jumped to forty-one percent that's the wage change to that that was pretty exciting so again very compelling.

CTE Outcomes Survey: Use of Findings

John Carrese - I'm going to talk about now how we use these findings.

Use of Findings

John Carrese - If we can go to those slides Mike, I'll tell you why were so, how we're using that kind of compelling wage data over time.

Michael Lesiecki - Now the first item here is accountability evidence supporting the efficacy of CTE.

John Carrese - Yeah we were really interested in looking at how we can show that our investment of taxpayer dollars, state funds is used wisely that were accountable and being good stewards of that investment, I won't go through all of these but you can imagine you have to do these things accreditation reporting, gainful employment reporting, maybe recording on your veterans, the CT data port our Launchboard tool it's our internal tool in California for making student data available to practitioners for decision-making and that's a pretty exciting tool to make data more transparent and available to practitioner. But the promotional information and how we can underscore the value of CTE I think one of the outcomes it's been very exciting about this project where you can report at a college level and you're getting data from your survey on about how your CTE students are doing, you can report that out to the community, to your internal staff and faculty and also you can market for prospective students, to parents and prospective students the power of CTE programs in terms of giving students successful outcomes, employment in the labor market and wage gains that are very you know that are hard to argue with. I mean it's a great return on investment when you're getting a 40-percent wage increase. The program review improvement data again I mentioned this before but I just won't talk about every bullet but you know students by reporting this data back to us are really giving us the information about how well our programs are doing and should we be modifying or renewing programs to make them more relevant to employers and industry or should be we discontinue a program because the outcomes are really poor and not very you know not much success being shown. So using the data in this way to drive decision-making I think is a really important point using it with that advisory boards to drive discussions among the advisory boards and the and the Faculty of the College about how to guide the program in the future and to make it relevant, so next slide Mike. We're wrapping up here with me.

For More Detailed Findings:

John Carrese - Is this for more detailed findings?

Michael Lesiecki - We're there John and your timing is perfect.

John Carrese - Okay great , so I just want you to know that there's great resources and information about this whole project about California's CTE employment outcome survey at that you can go to that link on your screen, you can find that when you get there you can find frequently asked questions about the project, the actual survey tool we use, interactive data visualizations and this is a way you can see data displayed about a statewide survey, but also some of the individual colleges have their data there and it allows you to select different ways of looking at the data so you can focus on what you're most interested in. One very popular ways to look at the data but not all of the data is that just the program of study and finding out how students are doing in a particular program of studies, so your kind of slicing the data that way you can see well maybe how your health science students doing in terms of weight gain and employment and the other metrics know very important resources there and you're welcome to go and click on that and find out more and if you're interested and then maybe next slide that will be my last slide Mike.

Contact Information

Michael Lesiecki –We're there John, the contact information.

John Carrese - Yeah so here you can you can see my contact info, but also kind of the general of contact and so if you want to contact someone at the Santa Rosa Junior-college, see whose managing this whole project if you click on that link you can go in the upper left corner of the home page and you'll see a I think it will say contact us and that will allow you to get access to folks there at the college who might be able to answer some of your questions. So with that I'll stop Mike and turn it back to you.

Michael Lesiecki -John just perfect, perfect timing and excellent information, I'm going to hit you right away with a question from our audience as I advance to the question pane here.

Questions

Michael Lesiecki - Here's the thing have you done any reporting to the WIOA System the W, I, O, A system? You know they they're looking for seventy percent of their uh and you know as an employment rate for their clients are you involved with that at all?

John Carrese – We are and interestingly in California there was new legislation passed it's called Strong Workforce Program Legislation and the Governor has invested, Governor and Legislature in California invested 200 million dollars in CTE education across all of our colleges in the state, but part of that legislation calls for us to work it closely very closely using the same metrics about outcomes student outcomes with our workforce boards WIOA, is your locally we call them workforce development boards in California so these employment metrics some of them that we just talked about are going to be a shame for our workforce development system in the state and our community college system so that it's great really because we'll be using the same metrics and we're working much more closely with our workforce development system in tracking outcomes of our students at the college's and their clients who their serving to help get back into the labor force.

Michael Lesiecki – Excellent, excellent thing one more question as we're talking when you showed that data for California you showed the program people at 1782 going up to 2457 or whatever the exact number was what's the minimum wage in California now?

John Carrese - Your testing my knowledge.

Michael Lesiecki -Guess I could find online.

John Carrese – You could Google that for me and telling me. A lot of local cities have you know \$15 an hour if you look

Michael Lesiecki – I'm gonna look.

John Carrese - I think it might be.

Michael Lesiecki - I think San Francisco is certainly up there.

John Carrese – It might be climbing up to 12 in California but...

Michael Lesiecki - A couple of our attendees say it's between 10 and 10.50 approximately an hour in California so that's reasonable. Thank you attendees.

John Carrese – Yeah, progressing up towards 12 over time, but that's what is now 10, 10.50.

Michael Lesiecki - Here's a funny question John how did you coerce all every community college notice the word I use their coerce, every community collagen in the state to participate in this?

John Carrese -Well I think it wasn't coercion it was results that can tell people to join this and you can see in that chart where the number of colleges started 15 it's kind of hovered around 35-40 in the

middle years and then a group 70 and when it grew to 70 was because people were you know word-of-mouth very powerful we were all at conference together twice a year, the people were saying wow you know this is great data and it was getting people to voluntarily join the project and do it with using their own resources I want to emphasize that, wasn't until this year now in 2017 that the state Chancellor's office system is funding it for everyone some people were doing it on their own with the marketplace really kind of being driven by our colleges and as seeing that was a good investment of resources and important data to get into I wouldn't say there was so much coercion going on.

Michael Lesiecki -Well thank you John. You know what we look at our time or 90 seconds to go we are so perfect on time.

Join Us- All Webinars 3 pm Eastern

Michael Lesiecki - John let me wrap up with a couple of announcements folks so here's the advertisement right if you like these webinars coming up there are four part series and it all has to do about writing from money you're going to write proposals to the NSF ATE programs its a special one some of your Department of Labor grants are winding down I know some of the ones that we're involved here are ending next September. You can see the dates right there four grants John look at these titles starting point, grant proposal resources, developing stakeholder partnerships and finally tips for a competitive proposal so those are all one our events and there's a unique opportunity on this one you know during these things you don't get much of a chance to actually talk to people with your questions so there's going to be a follow-up webinar with open microphones you can see the dates below that allow you to ask more detailed questions so you know following each of these one week after the webinar itself will be a call in answer session in some cases with the head of the NSF's program in this area so take a look- right at the bottom ATEcenters.org/ CCTA that's US, Centers Collaborative for Technical Assistance.

Join us in Salt Lake City, UT!

Michael Lesiecki - And by the way join us in Salt Lake City, Utah July's 17th through the 20th that's this coming summer for the high-impact technology exchange conference HI-TEC, that's where you're going to meet people just like ourselves talking about these sort of things the latest innovations on the technical education side.

DOL and NSF Workforce Convening

Michael Lesiecki -The CCTA sponsors a after event convening on Friday July 21 on the conference website you'll see information about how to log into that good opportunity to share best practices.

Webinar Survey

Michael Lesiecki – Folks, John right at the end of our time here as you leave today's webinar as you click close on your browser's another browser window opens up and there's just a couple of questions for you to respond to that helps us improve our webinar series and helps us demonstrate our impact to our funder the National Science Foundation. John want to personally thank you for the information you shared with this, California did win the race today versus Arizona but don't worry we're chasing you fast.

John Carrese - I know yeah well it's good to have competition and people to keep pushing you forward. Thank you Mike, it was a pleasure to participate in this with you and look forward to more in the future.

Michael Lesiecki -Lovely thanks everyone this officially ends our webinar, I'm stopping the recording. Thank you again for joining, pleasure having you today, goodbye everyone.